

COMMISSIONERS
SUSAN BITTER SMITH – Chairman

BOB STUMP BOB BURNS DOUG LITTLE TOM FORESE





Chief Administrative Law Judge

ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION

2015 DEC -9 P 4: 06

AZ CORP COMMISSION DOCKET CONTROL

December 9, 2015

Parties to Docket No. E-00000J-14-0023

The attached email from Mohave Electric Cooperative to Chairman Bitter Smith was docketed by Chairman Bitter Smith's office today.

Because the email does not indicate that it was provided to all parties to this proceeding, it is being provided to you at this time.

Sincerely

Teena Jibilian

Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge

Arizona Corporation Commission DOCKETED

DEC 0 9 2015

DOCKETED IN

1200 WEST WASHINGTON STREET; PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007-2927 / 400 WEST CONGRESS STREET; TUCSON, ARIZONA 85701-1347 WWW.AZCC.GOV

This document is available in alternative formats by contacting Shaylin Bernal, ADA Coordinator, voice phone number 602-542-3931, E-mail <u>SABernal@azcc.gov</u>.

Copies of the foregoing mailed/delivered this day of December, 2015 to:

PARTIES TO THIS DOCKET (Service List)

Dillon Holmes CLEAN POWER ARIZONA 9635 N. 7th Street, #47520 Phoenix, AZ 85068 dillon@cleanpoweraz.org

Consented to Service by Email

C. Webb Crockett
Patrick J. Black
FENNEMORE CRAIG, PC
2394 East Camelback Road, Suite 600
Phoenix, AZ 85016-3429
Attorneys for Freeport Minerals and AECC
wcrocket@fclaw.com
pblack@fclaw.com

Consented to Service by Email

Court S. Rich
ROSE LAW GROUP, PC
7144 E. Stetson Dr., Suite 300
Scottsdale, AZ 85251
Attorneys for The Alliance for Solar Choice
CRich@RoseLawGroup.com

Consented to Service by Email

Garry D. Hays LAW OFFICES OF GARRY D. HAYS PC 1702 East Highland Avenue, Suite 204 Phoenix, AZ 85016 Attorney for Arizona Solar Deployment Alliance

Timothy M. Hogan ARIZONA CENTER FOR LAW IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST 202 E. McDowell Rd., Suite 153 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Attorneys for the Vote Solar Initiative and Western Resource Advocates

Rick Gillam Director of Research and Analysis THE VOTE SOLAR INITIATIVE 1120 Pearl Street, Suite 200 Boulder, CO 80302 Briana Kobor
Program Director – DG Regulatory Policy
THE VOTE SOLAR INITIATIVE
360 22nd Street, Suite 730
Oakland, CA 94612

Ken Wilson WESTERN RESOURCE ADVOCATES 2260 Baseline Road, Suite 200 Boulder, CO 80302

Craig A. Marks
CRAIG A. MARKS, PLC
10645 N. Tatum Blvd., Suite 200-676
Phoenix, AZ 85028
Attorney for Arizona Utility Ratepayer Alliance
Craig.Marks@azbar.org

Consented to Service by Email

Meghan H. Grabel
OSBORN MALEDON, PA
2929 N. Central Ave., Suite 2100
Phoenix, AZ 85012
Attorney for Arizona Investment Council
mgrabel@omlaw.com
gyaquinto@arizonaic.org

Consented to Service by Email

Daniel W. Pozefsky RESIDENTIAL UTILITY CONSUMER OFFICE 1110 W. Washington, Suite 220 Phoenix, AZ 85007 dpozefsky@azruco.gov

Consented to Service by Email

Jennifer Cranston
GALLAGHER & KENNEDY, PA
2575 E. Camelback Rd., Suite 1100
Phoenix, AZ 85016
Attorneys for Grand Canyon State Electric Cooperative Association, Inc. jennifer.cranston@gknet.com

Consented to Service by Email for Grand Canyon State Electric Cooperative Association, Inc.

Also Attorney for Arizona Electric Power Cooperative, Inc. and Dixie Escalante Rural Electric Association, Inc., who have not consented to Email service

Greg Patterson
MUNGER CHADWICK
916 W. Adams, Suite 3
Phoenix, AZ 85007
Attorneys for Arizona Competitive Power Alliance

Michael W. Patten
Timothy J. Sabo
Jason D. Gellman
SNELL & WILMER, LLP
One Arizona Center
400 E. Van Buren St., Suite 1900
Phoenix, AZ 85004
Attorneys for Ajo Improvement Company,
Morenci Water and Electric Company, Trico Electric Cooperative, Inc.,
Tucson Electric Power Company, and UNS Electric, Inc.

Gary Pierson ARIZONA ELECTRIC POWER COOPERATIVE, INC. PO BOX 670 1000 S. Highway 80 Benson, AZ 85602

Thomas A. Loquvam
Thomas L. Mumaw
Melissa M. Krueger
PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORPORATION
PO BOX 53999, MS 8695
Phoenix, AZ 85072
Attorneys for Arizona Public Service Company

Kerri A. Carnes ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY PO Box 53999, MS 9712 Phoenix, AZ 85072

Charles Kretek, General Counsel COLUMBUS ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. PO Box 631 Deming, NM 88031 LaDel Laub, President and CEO DIXIE ESCALANTE RURAL ELECTRIC ASSOCIATION, INC. 71 East Highway 56 Beryl UT 84714

Steven Lunt Chief Executive Officer DUNCAN VALLEY ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. 379597 AZ 75 PO Box 440 Duncan, AZ 85534

Dan McClendon Marcus Lewis GARKANE ENERGY COOPERATIVE, INC. PO Box 465 Loa, UT 84747

William P. Sullivan CURTIS, GOODWIN, SULLIVAN, UDALL & SCHWAB, PLC 501 East Thomas Road Phoenix, AZ 85012-3205 Attorneys for Garkane Energy Cooperative, Inc., Mohave Electric Cooperative, Inc. and Navopache Electric Cooperative, Inc.

Than W. Ashby, Office Manager GRAHAM COUNTY ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. 9 W. Center St. PO Drawer B Pima, AZ 85543

Tyler Carlson, CEO Peggy Gillman, Manager of Public Affairs MOHAVE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. PO Box 1045 Bullhead City, AZ 86430

Richard C. Adkerson, CEO Michael J. Arnold, Director MORENCI WATER AND ELECTRIC COMPANY 333 N. Central Avenue Phoenix, AZ 85004 Charles R. Moore Paul O'Dair NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. 1878 West White Mountain Blvd. Lakeside, AZ 85929

Jeffrey W. Crockett CROCKETT LAW GROUP, PLLC 1702 E. Highland Ave., Suite 204 Phoenix, AZ 85016 Attorney for Sulphur Springs Valley Electric Cooperative, Inc.

Kirby Chapman, CFAO Jack Blair, CMSO SULPHUR SPRINGS VALLEY ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. 311 E. Wilcox Sierra Vista, AZ 85650

Vincent Nitido, CEO/General Manager TRICO ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. 8600 West Tangerine Road Marana, AZ 85658

Bradley S. Carroll TUCSON ELECTRIC POWER COMPANY 88 E. Broadway Blvd., MS HQE910 PO Box 711 Tucson, AZ 85701-0711

David G. Hutchens, President Kevin P. Larson, Director UNS ELECTRIC, INC. 88 E. Broadway Blvd., MS HQE901 PO Box 711 Tucson, AZ 85701-0711 Janice Alward, Chief Counsel
Legal Division
ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
1200 West Washington Street
Phoenix, AZ 85007
tford@azcc.gov
rlloyd@azcc.gov
tbroderick@azcc.gov
mlaudone@azcc.gov
mscott@azcc.gov

Consented to Service by Email

By:

Tammy Velande

Assistant to Trena Jibilian

HEARING



RECERO Box 1045, Bullhead City, AZ 86430

2015 DEC -9 A 9: 23

December 8, 2015

AZ CORP COMMISSION DOCKET CONTROL

Chairman Susan Bitter Smith Arizona Corporation Commission Commissioners Wing 1200 W. Washington – 2nd Floor Phoenix, AZ 85007

(sent via email: BitterSmith-web@azcc.gov)

RECEIVED

DEC 09 2015

Dear Chairman Bitter Smith:

ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION HEARING DIVISION

My name is Lyn R. Opalka. I've been a resident in Mohave County and been a member of the Mohave Electric Cooperative (MEC) since 1966. Currently, and for 20 years, I've been the President of the Board of Mohave Electric. I've worked in a number of businesses in the area and have been active in the community served by Mohave and in its health care, government, as well as was one of the original founders of the Colorado River Republican Women's group.

We cannot understand why Mohave has been included in the generic proceeding before you by the Law Judge. We do not have an active Net Metering filing nor have proposed Net Metering changes in charges. We are not a party to the APS rate filing that initiated the generic proceeding. We are not sure if you are aware that the recent Law Judge order unnecessarily swept up MEC in a matter of significance and relevance only to APS and TEP concerning their net metering and distributed generation issues.

By all measures our service territory economics are depressed. I see it every day. The cost of living is critical in this area. Electricity is a key cost. Our fixed income retirees, which represent a significant number of our membership, can't afford increases in essential services such as electricity. Please do not force our members to unnecessarily spend tens of thousands of dollars in a proceeding that we are not a party to, and cannot be described to our member/voters as reasonable or rational.

Our Cooperative has no issues before the Commission concerning net metering and distributed generation; we cannot reasonably describe to our members why we are a party, we have no data to present, nor analysis of the issues brought by APS or issues of the Commission. We will, just to comply with the ALJ ordered mailed notice to members, be forced to incur the cost of postage (approximately \$20,000 alone) and the cost of labor, which in total may well exceed a dollar per meter; and only serve to confuse our members as we have issue in play. We will spend countless hours explaining why we are being arbitrarily required to publish and communicate to members on an issue that we are not seeking to resolve or change.

Chairman Bitter Smith December 8, 2015 Page 2

The cost of mailing does not include the expense of hiring consultants to eventually answer questions and provide data/analysis to respond to question of the proceeding. Small utilities like MEC do not have on staff Rate Personnel and only hire consultants when we seek a rate change. There will also be the cost of devoting management time to research the Commission proceeding issues, taking away time from actual MEC issues and programs. The APS and TEP issues in the pending APS and TEP cases are not being sought for resolution by MEC.

Please exclude MEC from the generic proceeding first, because the issues before you do not come from the Cooperative; second, because of the tremendous direct and indirect unnecessary costs that will be inflicted on the Cooperative and its members; and third and lastly, the lack of relevant and significant information to be produced and developed from MEC that would be of benefit to the Commission or the members of the Cooperative.

Please instruct the Judge to exclude Mohave Electric from this proceeding as it provides little or no value to our 33,000 members except raise their costs and confuse them. I am also concerned about the due process elements of the Order that has been issued, but appeal to you for relief.

Sincerely

MOHAVE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC.

Lyn R. Opalka

President of the Board

Cc: Commissioners Forese, Little, Stump, Burns (via email)